EL4222 Stylistics and Drama Session No. 10

I. We want to look very quickly at Burton's classification of moves in this session. (There is plenty of detail, but the main framework is more important.) Burton's classification has been used in Nash (opening of *Hamlet*) and Toolan (conversation in *Portrait of an Artist as a Young Man*).

Table (from Robertson 1986: 6)		
Transaction coincides with overall purp		
Exchange	coincides with	topic
Move	coincides with	speech turn
Act	coincides with	clause

2. Burton distinguishes between Explicit Boundary and Conversational Exchanges.

Rank III: Exchange (Explicit Boundary)

Elements of Structure	Structures	Classes of Move
Frame (Fr)		Fr: Framing
Focus (Fo)	either Fr or Fo ^ S	Fo: Focusing
Supporting (S)		S: Supporting

Rank III: Exchange (Conversational) — Opening, Challenging, Re-Opening

Elements of Structure	Structures	Classes of Move
Initiation (I) Responses (R) Re-Initiation (I ^r)	I(R(I ^r (R) ⁿ) ⁿ) ⁿ	I: Opening or Challenging or Re- Opening R: Supporting I ^r : Bound-Opening

3. The main difference is that she believes in an IR, as opposed to IR(F), structure for conversational exchanges.

- 4. She allows for 'incomplete' exchanges by suggesting that the next move could be a Challenging Move.
- (a) A **Supporting Move** is 'any move that maintains the framework set up by a preceding Initiatory Move' (p. 150) *ie*, an *expected* response is given.

First and appropriate second parts include:

Marker	Acknowledge (including giving attention/ non-hostile silence)
Summons	Accept
Metastatement	Accept
Informative	Acknowledge
Elicitation	Reply
Directive	React
Accuse	Excuse

- (b) A **Challenging Move** functions 'to hold up the progress of that [the] topic or topic-introduction in some way' (*ibid*.). This can be done by
- 'withholding an expected or appropriate reciprocal Act' (*ibid*.) eg no Reply supplied after an Elicitation; or
- 'supplying an unexpected and inappropriate Act where the expectation of another has been set up' (p. 151) eg Elicitation followed by an Accuse.

She claims that 'although I have chosen the mnemonic "Challenge", I certainly do not intend it necessarily to indicate hostility' (p. 151). She says 'not ... necessarily', but that it *could*, obviously.

The Supporting v. Challenging framework therefore seems to highlight interpersonal relations between characters.

You might want to consider whether the Supporting v. Challenging distinction can be mapped onto the **co-operative** behaviour distinction.

4a. There are also some acts that deal with the rhetorical structure or logical development of an argument:

TYPES OF 'INFORMATIVE'

- additive
- adversative
- causal

TYPES OF 'COMMENT'

- repeat
- restate
- qualify

5. **Bound-** and **Re-opening Moves** occur when the move relates to something brought up in the previous exchange; a Bound-Opening Move occurs after a *Supporting Move*; a Re-opening Move occurs after a *Challenging Move*.

6. Example from Burton (I have abandoned Burton's three columns, and adapt the table format from last week instead).

Text	Act	Move	Exchange
TRANSACTION I			
BEN: I Kaw	m ^I	Frame	Boundary
2 What about this?	s ²	Opening	Conversa-
3 Listen to this!	S		tional:
4 A man of 87 wanted to cross the road	inf		Opening
5 But there was a lot of traffic see	adv4 ³		
6 He couldn't see how he was going to	adv5		
squeeze through			
7 So he crawled under a lorry	cau		
GUS 8 He what?	el⁴	Challenging	
BEN 9 He crawled under a lorry	rept7⁵	Re-opening	
10 A stationary lorry	qual9		
GUS I I No?	ack10 ⁶	Supporting	
BEN 12 The lorry started and ran over him	add7 ⁷	Bound-	
		Opening	
GUS 13 Go on!	ack12	Supporting	
BEN 14 That's what it says here	com l 2		
GUS 15 Get away!	ack12		
BEN 16 It's enough to make you want to	ack12		
puke isn't it?			
GUS 17 Who advised him to do a thing like	ack12		
that?			
BEN 18 A man of 87 crawling under a lorry	rept4,7 ⁸		

¹ *m* is marker, like 'Oh', 'Now', or here, 'Kaw'.

⁴ *el* is elicit

² s is starter; it paves the way for the main act, here inf or inform

³ adv (adversative) and cau (causative) are 'rhetorical' markers; see above.

⁵ *rept* is repeat; *qual* is qualify

⁶ ack is acknowledge

⁷ add is additive

⁸ rept is repeat

EL4222/Session 10/Page 2

GUS 19 It's unbelievable	ack		
BEN 20 It's down here in black and white	com		
GUS 21 Incredible	ack		
TRANSACTION 2			
GUS I I want to ask you something	ms ⁹	Focus	Boundary
BEN 2 (No response)	_	Challenging	
TRANSACTION 3			
BEN I What are you doing out there?	el	Opening	Opening
GUS 2 Well I was just —	repl	Supporting	
BEN 3 What about the tea?	el	Bound-	
		Opening	
GUS 4 I'm just going to make it	rep3	Supporting	
BEN 5 Well go on, make it	dir ¹⁰	Bound-	
		Opening	
GUS 6 Yes, I will	rea 11	Supporting	

(I have included Burton's acts, but they are there for the sake of completeness rather than anything else. I don't advise you to memorise them. Stick to exchanges and moves.)

Extract from last week, applying the Burtonian scheme instead.

Living room. Early evening. SARAH gets up, goes to the drinks table to collect her glass, sits again on the chaise longue.
I RICHARD. Pleasant day?
2 SARAH. Mmn. I was in the village this morning.
3 RICHARD. Oh yes? See anyone?
4 SARAH. Not really, no. Had lunch.
5 RICHARD. In the village?
6 SARAH. Yes.
7 RICHARD. Any good?
8 SARAH. Quite fair. (She sits.)
9 RICHARD. What about this afternoon? Pleasant afternoon?
10 SARAH. Oh yes. Quite marvellous.
II RICHARD. Your lover came, did he?
12 SARAH. Mmnn. Oh yes.
13 RICHARD. Did you show him the hollyhocks? Slight pause.
14 SARAH. The hollyhocks?
15 RICHARD. Yes
16 SARAH. No, I didn't.
17 RICHARD. Oh.
18 SARAH. Should I have done?
19 RICHARD. No, no. Its simply that I seem to remember your saying he was interested in gardening.
20 SARAH. Mmnn, yes, he is.
Pause.
Not all that interested, actually.
21 RICHARD. Ah.
Pause.

7. (a) Can we think about authentic interaction in an institutional setting – here a Singapore law court?

WITNESS: I I solemnly and sincerely swear that the evidence I will be giving in this court	
shall be the truth the whole truth and nothing but the truth	

⁹ *ms* is metastatement ¹⁰ *dir* is direct

¹¹ rea is react

EL4222/Session 10/Page 3

 COUNSEL: 2 Witness can you please state your name to the court? WITNESS: 3 My name is Tan Gan Kiat. COUNSEL: 4 Your honour that's G-A-N K-I-A-T 5 Can you tell the court how old you are and where are you attending school? WITNESS: 6 I am eighteen years old and studying at Singapore Polytechnic. COUNSEL: 7 Which faculty? WITNESS: 8 Mechanical engineering. COUNSEL: 9 Witness, on the twenty-sixth of September nineteen ninety-nine, what were you doing? WITNESS: 10 I was playing football at Yuan Ching Secondary School COUNSEL: 11 Your honour that's Y-U-A-N C-H-I-N-G 12 Now at what time did the game start? WITNESS: 13 In the morning about ten a.m. COUNSEL: 14 How many people were there? WITNESS: 15 My team has fifteen persons including three girls.
 COUNSEL: 4 Your honour that's G-A-N K-I-A-T 5 Can you tell the court how old you are and where are you attending school? WITNESS: 6 I am eighteen years old and studying at Singapore Polytechnic. COUNSEL: 7 Which faculty? WITNESS: 8 Mechanical engineering. COUNSEL: 9 Witness, on the twenty-sixth of September nineteen ninety-nine, what were you doing? WITNESS: 10 I was playing football at Yuan Ching Secondary School COUNSEL: 11 Your honour that's Y-U-A-N C-H-I-N-G 12 Now at what time did the game start? WITNESS: 13 In the morning about ten a.m. COUNSEL: 14 How many people were there?
 5 Can you tell the court how old you are and where are you attending school? WITNESS: 6 I am eighteen years old and studying at Singapore Polytechnic. COUNSEL: 7 Which faculty? WITNESS: 8 Mechanical engineering. COUNSEL: 9 Witness, on the twenty-sixth of September nineteen ninety-nine, what were you doing? WITNESS: 10 I was playing football at Yuan Ching Secondary School COUNSEL: 11 Your honour that's Y-U-A-N C-H-I-N-G I2 Now at what time did the game start? WITNESS: 13 In the morning about ten a.m. COUNSEL: 14 How many people were there?
 WITNESS: 6 I am eighteen years old and studying at Singapore Polytechnic. COUNSEL: 7 Which faculty? WITNESS: 8 Mechanical engineering. COUNSEL: 9 Witness, on the twenty-sixth of September nineteen ninety-nine, what were you doing? WITNESS: 10 I was playing football at Yuan Ching Secondary School COUNSEL: 11 Your honour that's Y-U-A-N C-H-I-N-G I2 Now at what time did the game start? WITNESS: 13 In the morning about ten a.m. COUNSEL: 14 How many people were there?
 COUNSEL: 7 Which faculty? WITNESS: 8 Mechanical engineering. COUNSEL: 9 Witness, on the twenty-sixth of September nineteen ninety-nine, what were you doing? WITNESS: 10 I was playing football at Yuan Ching Secondary School COUNSEL: 11 Your honour that's Y-U-A-N C-H-I-N-G I2 Now at what time did the game start? WITNESS: 13 In the morning about ten a.m. COUNSEL: 14 How many people were there?
 WITNESS: 8 Mechanical engineering. COUNSEL: 9 Witness, on the twenty-sixth of September nineteen ninety-nine, what were you doing? WITNESS: 10 I was playing football at Yuan Ching Secondary School COUNSEL: 11 Your honour that's Y-U-A-N C-H-I-N-G I2 Now at what time did the game start? WITNESS: 13 In the morning about ten a.m. COUNSEL: 14 How many people were there?
 COUNSEL: 9 Witness, on the twenty-sixth of September nineteen ninety-nine, what were you doing? WITNESS: 10 I was playing football at Yuan Ching Secondary School COUNSEL: 11 Your honour that's Y-U-A-N C-H-I-N-G 12 Now at what time did the game start? WITNESS: 13 In the morning about ten a.m. COUNSEL: 14 How many people were there?
 COUNSEL: 9 Witness, on the twenty-sixth of September nineteen ninety-nine, what were you doing? WITNESS: 10 I was playing football at Yuan Ching Secondary School COUNSEL: 11 Your honour that's Y-U-A-N C-H-I-N-G 12 Now at what time did the game start? WITNESS: 13 In the morning about ten a.m. COUNSEL: 14 How many people were there?
were you doing? WITNESS: 10 I was playing football at Yuan Ching Secondary School COUNSEL: 11 Your honour that's Y-U-A-N C-H-I-N-G 12 Now at what time did the game start? WITNESS: 13 In the morning about ten a.m. COUNSEL: 14 How many people were there?
 WITNESS: 10 I was playing football at Yuan Ching Secondary School COUNSEL: 11 Your honour that's Y-U-A-N C-H-I-N-G 12 Now at what time did the game start? WITNESS: 13 In the morning about ten a.m. COUNSEL: 14 How many people were there?
COUNSEL: 11 Your honour that's Y-U-A-N C-H-I-N-G 12 Now at what time did the game start? WITNESS: 13 In the morning about ten a.m. COUNSEL: 14 How many people were there?
I2 Now at what time did the game start? WITNESS: I3 In the morning about ten a.m. COUNSEL: I4 How many people were there?
WITNESS: 13 In the morning about ten a.m. COUNSEL: 14 How many people were there?
COUNSEL: 14 How many people were there?
with the solution of the solut
I6 One of them is my girlfriend.
17 The other team has about fifteen boys.
,
COUNSEL: 18 Witness, do you know these other persons?
WITNESS: 19 No.
COUNSEL: 20 Then why did you play with them?
WITNESS: 21 They came later and asked us whether we would like to challenge them
and we said okay.
COUNSEL: 22 Witness, can you tell the court what colour were your jerseys?
WITNESS: 23 My team was wearing blue and white Puma jerseys and shorts.
24 The other team just wore their casual clothes.
COUNSEL: 25 Can you please tell the court during the game what happened?
WITNESS: 26 About half-way through I saw three persons surrounding my girlfriend.
COUNSEL: 27 Where were you when you saw this?
WITNESS: 28 I was still in the field playing football.
COUNSEL: 29 Who were the three persons that were surrounding your girlfriend?
WITNESS: 30 They were from the other team but they were just watching the game.
COUNSEL: 31 Please continue
32 Then what happened?
WITNESS: 33 I heard my girlfriend shouted 'Kiat!'
34 So I ran to her and told the three of them to go away.
35 Then one of them told me to mind my own business.
36 I told them to not get violent and talk it out.
37 Then one of them slapped me.
COUNSEL: 38 Witness, where was your girlfriend at this time?
WITNESS: 39 She is beside me.
40 On my left.
COUNSEL: 41 Witness, could you recognise the person who slapped you?
WITNESS: 42 Yes.
COUNSEL: 43 How can you recognise him?
WITNESS: 44 Because he was standing in front of me.
COUNSEL: 45 Is this person who slapped you in this court room today?
WITNESS: 47 Yes.
COUNSEL: 48 Can you please point him out?
WITNESS: 49 He is the one wearing a blue shirt.

(b) Here is another institutional, but less formal, situation: a publisher's planning meeting. SI is the informal chair, female in the 30s; S2 is male, mid-20s; and S3 is male, 30s. They are planning the production schedules for educational materials.

SI: (I) Erm can we keep these intermediate cassette schedules as draft until [4 secs] erm	
[3 secs] because I, I have to erm get a confirmed date for the transcript from the	
au/thor and stuff	
S2: (2) /Yeah that's fine	
SI: (3) Cos the authors have to finalise the tapescript and until they /do that erm	
S2: (4) /Yep it's not a problem	
[6 secs]	
SI: (5) I can't really say that all this is going to work [sounds of pages rustling] and then	
Changes which is finally getting moving [4 secs] now erm can we change the film	

 date for Teacher's Book One to the 30th of May because we're we're putting in some extra pages so I'm waiting for typescript for those extra pages S2: (6) What's the extent¹² 	
S2: (6) What's the extent ¹²	
SI: (7) [whispered] the extent	
S2: (8) Is it going to remain the same	
S1: (9) Yeah it should be one-seven-six yeah I think we've got spare pages it's not a problem	
[3 secs]	
S2: (10) Fine	
SI: (II) Erm [sound of paper tearing] [4 secs] and we need stock by July, early July we	
have to be a bit careful with these three now because the Loescher warehouse	
closes from the first of August to the 22nd so we must allow time for things to	
get there and get into the warehouse before it closes	
S3: (12) How do you spell Loescher is it L-O-E-S-C-H-E-R	
SI: (13) Yeah erm but I mean that seems that I mean based on the printing time we've	
allowed here we should get stock [S3: mm] early July [S3: yeah] anyway so that's a	
month to get to Italy [3 secs] so that one's going okay, we've got Workbook	
Book Two film okay by the 29th of May, shouldn't be any problem at all in fact	
should be, should be quite a lot earlier	
S2: (14) Do I need to do price fixes for Teach/er's Book One	
SI: (15) /Oh gosh erm	
S2: (16) Do, don't /l	
SI: (17) /Yes actually Workbook Two's probably the most urgent now [4 secs] I reckon	
we'll probably have film in about three weeks for Workbook Two	
S2: (18) Right it's not going to change in quantity is it I mean I think we've bought the	
pap/er for it already	
SI: (19) /Change in quantity no	
S2: (20) Fine this is the bit where Kate goes oh it's actually a hundred-and-ninety-six	
[laughs mockingly] [S1: no no no] don't mean that erm right fine great so I'll just, I	
just leave it as on schedule	
[From Carter & McCarthy 1996: 147–149]	

(c) Can Burton's framework be applied to an authentic interaction, and a argument at that? Here is a transcript of three people: Henry and Zelda are a lower-middle-class Jewish couple in their mid-sixties; they have two married sons and an unmarried teenaged daughter. The third person is their neighbour Irene, mid-thirties, also lower-middle class Jewish and has four children (from five to sixteen). Prior to the transcript, Henry and Irene had been arguing about intermarriage between Jews and Gentiles. Henry feels strongly that they should be discouraged but Irene feels that it is difficult to interfere with young people's choices these days. The transcript starts with Henry referring to how his own elder brother was influenced by their mother long ago not to go out with a Gentile woman.

(Transcription convention: bits within single asterisks overlap with adjacent bits within single asterisks; bits within double asterisks overlap with adjacent bits within double asterisks. CAPS indicate stress; colons indicate lengthened sound.)

Now try to analyse this, and comment on what the difficulties were. Then go on to list the ways in which 'challenges' can occur.

HENRY: I But he – the fact is that he listens – to my mother.	
2 And, he did her wishes.	
3 *We respected our mother* to the hilt.	
IRENE: 4 *But that was YEA::RS ago.*	
HENRY: 5 But WHY shouldn't you **respect your mother** today?	
IRENE: 6 **Wait a – wait a minute.**	
7 That's HIS op*inion!*	
HENRY: 8 *Why* should it **be different?**	
IRENE: 9 **All right.** Right.	
10 That was YEARS ago.	
l la l don't feel that	
HENRY: 12 Do you *agree with* me?	
IRENE: I I b *the kids*	
13a I don't think the **kids:**	
ZELDA: 14 **Heh?**	
HENRY: 15 Do you agree with *me?*	

¹² Extent is a publishing term to mean 'number of pages'.

IRENE: I 3b *today*	
ZELDA: 16 No I don't agree with him.	
17 He has his own beliefs.	

8. Toolan makes use of Burton's categories of moves for a statistical distribution between characters in Joyce's *Portrait of an artist as a young man.*

Challenging		Supporting		Opening*	
Dante	23	Mr Dedalus	10	Mr Dedalus	15
Casey	11	Uncles Charles	4	Casey	7
Mr Dedalus	6	Casey	2	Dante	I
Mrs Dedalus	7	Mrs Dedalus	I	Mrs Dedalus	I
Uncles Charles	I				
TOTAL	50	Total	17	TOTAL	24

*includes re-opening and bound-opening

Toolan, for example, also analyses a scene and draws attention to the failed transactions as a result of Challenging Moves:

TRANSACTION	
Opening	— There's a tasty bit here as you call the pope's nose. If any lady or gentleman
Challenging	He held a piece of fowl up on the prong of his carving-fork. Nobody spoke. He put it on his
	own plate, saying:
Re-opening	— Well, you can't say you but you were asked. I think I had better eat it myself because I'm
	not well in the health lately
	He winked at Stephen and, replacing the dish-cover, began to eat again.
Challenging	There was silence while he ate. Then he said:
TRANSACTION	
Opening	— Well now, the day kept up fine after all. There were plenty of strangers down too.
Challenging	Nobody spoke. He said again:
Re-opening	— I think there were more strangers down than last Christmas.
Challenging	He looked around at the others whose faces were bent towards their plates, and receiving
	no reply, waited for a moment and said bitterly:
TRANSACTION	
Opening	 Well, my Christmas dinner has been spoiled anyhow.
Challenging	— There could be neither luck nor grace, Dante said, in a house where there is no respect
	for the pastors of the church.
	Mr Dedalus threw his knife and fork noisily on his plate.
Challenging	Respect! he said

TASK: No employ Toolan's methodology to this other dialogue, also from Joyce:

(a) Analyse the moves in terms of **Opening**, **Challenging**, **Supporting**, **Re-Opening**, **Bound Opening** or **Framing**/ Focusing Moves.

- (b) Now count the number of types of moves associated with Gabriel and Miss lvors.
- (c) Attempt to interpret those figures in the light of your reading of the passage.

(I justify using it here because it was not too long ago performed as a musical play; on the left – Christopher Walken as Gabriel Conroy –nominated for a 'Best Performance by a Leading Actor in a Musical' at the 2000 Tony Award. Cast members Spinella and Egan were also nominated, while the show garnered the Lucille Lortel Award.

There was also the 1987 film based on this short story starring Angelica Houston and Donal McCann – bottom left.)

From James Joyce's 'The Dead', Dubliners

When they had taken their places she said abruptly:

— I have a crow to pluck with you.

— With me? Said Gabriel.

She nodded her head gravely.

- What is it? Asked Gabriel, smiling at her solemn manner.

- Who is G. C.? answered Miss Ivors, turning her eyes upon him.



Gabriel coloured and was about to knit his brows, as if he did not understand, when she said bluntly:

— O, innocent Amy! I have found out that you write for *The Daily Express*¹³. Now, aren't you ashamed of yourself?

— Why should I be ashamed of myself? Asked Gabriel, blinking his eyes and trying to smile.

— Well, I'm ashamed of you, said Miss Ivors frankly. To say you'd write for a rag like that. I didn't think you were a West Briton.¹⁴

A look of perplexity appeared on Gabriel's face. It was true that he wrote a literary column every Wednesday in *The Daily Express*, for which he was paid fifteen shillings. But that did not make him a West Briton surely. The books he

received for review were almost more welcome than the paltry cheque. He loved to feel the covers and turn over the pages of newly printed books. Nearly every day when his teaching in the college was ended he used to wander down the quays to the second-hand booksellers, to Hickey's on Bachelor's Walk, to Webb's or Massey's on Aston's Quay,¹⁵ or to O'Clohissey's in the by-street. He did not know how to meet her charge. He wanted to say that literature was above politics. But they were friends of many years' standing and their careers had been parallel, first at the University¹⁶ and then as teachers: he could not risk a grandiose phrase with her. He continued blinking his eyes and trying to smile and murmured lamely that he saw nothing political in writing reviews of books.

When their turn to cross had come he was still perplexed and inattentive. Miss lvors promptly took his hand in a warm grasp and said in a soft friendly tone:

— Of course, I was only joking. Come, we cross now. When they were together again she spoke of the University question¹⁷ and Gabriel felt more at ease. A friend of hers had shown her his review of Browning's poems. That was how she had found out the secret: but she liked the review immensely. Then she said suddenly:

— O, Mr Conroy, will you come for an excursion to the Aran Isles¹⁸ this summer? We're going to stay there a whole month. It will be splendid out in the Atlantic. You ought to come. Mr Clancy is coming, and Mr Kilkelly and Kathleen Kearney. It would be splendid for Gretta too if she'd come. She's from Connacht¹⁹ isn't she?

- Her people are, said Gabriel shortly.
- But you will come, won't you? Said Miss Ivors, laying her warm hand eagerly on his arm.
- The fact is, said Gabriel, I have already arranged to go
- Go where? Asked Miss Ivors.
- Well, you know every year I go for a cycling tour with some fellows and so
- But where? Asked Miss Ivors.
- Well, we usually go to France or Belgium or perhaps Germany, said Gabriel awkwardly.
- And why do you go to France and Belgium, said Miss Ivors, instead of visiting your own land?
- Well, said Gabriel, it's partly to keep in touch with the languages and partly for a change.

¹³ A Dublin newspaper with Conservative and Unionist tendencies.

¹⁴ A member of the English nation in Ireland; an Anglo-Irishman; one who sympathises with the Unionist cause. Originally a strictly descriptive term employed by those who felt proud to be such, by the early twentieth century it was a term of opprobrium employed by Home Rulers and separatists.

¹⁵ Quays on both sides of the river Liffey immediately west of O'Connell Bridge where there were a number of booksellers.

¹⁶ University College did not admit women at the time when Gabriel and Miss Ivors might be reckoned to have attended university, so she must have studied at one of two other institutions which prepared candidates for the examinations of the Royal University.

¹⁷ A contentious issue in nineteenth- and early-twentieth-century Ireland was how to cater for the university needs of the Catholic majority when the major university in the country, Trinity College, Dublin, was distinctly Anglican in ethos and the secular institutions which the British government had founded in various centres had been largely deemed unacceptable by Catholic lay opinion and especially so by ecclesiastical edict.

¹⁸ Islands off the west coast of County Galway that are predominantly Irish-speaking.

¹⁹ One of the four provinces of Ireland.

— And haven't you your own language²⁰ to keep in touch with – Irish? Asked Miss Ivors.

— Well, said Gabriel, if it comes to that, you know, Irish is not my language.

Their neighbours had turned to listen to the cross examination. Gabriel glanced right and left nervously and tried to keep his good humour under the ordeal which was making a blush invade his forehead.

- And haven't you your own land to visit, continued Miss lvors, that you know nothing of, your own people, and your own country?

- O, to tell you the truth, retorted Gabriel suddenly, I'm sick of my own country, sick of it!

- Why? Asked Miss Ivors.

Gabriel did not answer for his retort had heated him.

— Why? Repeated Miss Ivors.

They had to go visiting together²¹ and, as he had not answered her, Miss Ivors said warmly:

— Of course, you've no answer.

Gabriel tried to cover his agitation by taking part in the dance with great energy. He avoided her eyes for he had seen a sour expression on her face. But when they met in the long chain he was surprised to feel his hand firmly pressed. She looked at him from under her brows for a moment quizzically until he smiled. Then, just as the chain was about to start again, she stood on tiptoe and whispered into his ear:

— West Briton!

(pp. 187–190, Penguin edition)

9. Many of the Challenging Moves are lack of responses – remember Jenny Thomas's remarks in relation to silence as not necessarily least face-threatening.

Similarly, we can examine Pygmalion in terms of Burton's categories of moves (pp. 128-9).

Opening	HIGGINS:SO you can come back or go to the devil: which you please.
Challenging/	LIZA: What am I to come back for?
Opening	
Supporting	HIGGINS: For the fun of it. That's why I took you in.
Opening	LIZA: And you may throw me out tomorrow if I don't do everything you want me to?
Supporting	HIGGINS: Yes: and you may walk out tomorrow if I don't do everything you want me to.
Opening	LIZA: And live with my stepmother?
Supporting	HIGGINS: Yes, or sell flowers.
Opening	LIZA: Oh! If I only could go back to my flower basket! I should be independent of both you and father and all the world! Why did you take my independence from me? Why did I give it up? I'm a slave now, for all my fine clothes.
Supporting	HIGGINS: Not a bit. I'll adopt you as my daughter and settle money on you if you like.
Opening	HIGGINS: Or would you rather marry Pickering?
Supporting/	LIZA: I wouldn't marry you if you asked me; and you're nearer my age than what he is.
Opening	
Challenging	HIGGINS: Than he is: not 'than what he is'

Compare this with Act 2 (pp. 37-38).

Opening	HIGGINS: Be off with you: I don't want you.
Supporting	LIZA: Don't you be so saucy. You ain't heard what I come for yet.
Opening	LIZA: Did you tell him I come in a taxi?
Challenging	MRS PEARCE: Nonsense, girl! what do you think a gentleman like Mr Higgins cares what you
	come in?
Opening [ostensibly ad- dressed to Mrs Pearce]	LIZA: Oh, we are proud! He ain't above giving lessons, not him: I heard him say so. Well, I ain't come here to ask for any compliment; and if my money's not good enough I can go elsewhere.
Challenging/Opening	HIGGINS: Good enough for what?
Supporting	LIZA: Good enough for yə-oo. Now you know, don't you?
Opening	LIZA: I'm coming to have lessons, I am. And to pay for em tə-oo: make no mistake.

²⁰ The Irish Ireland movement considered that Gaelic was the national language of Ireland and that all self-respecting Irish people should learn it as soon as possible. It was part of the movement's propagandist endeavour to ensure that the language was called Irish, and not Gaelic or Celtic, thereby affording it the same status as English enjoyed in England: Irish for the Irish, English for the English

²¹ A reference to a movement in the dance which involved Gabriel partnering Miss Ivors for a time. It is ironic in this context, where he has no intention of accompanying her on holiday to the Aran Islands.

Challenging	HIGGINS: Well!!!
Opening	HIGGINS: What do you expect me to say to you?
Challenging	LIZA: Well, if you was a gentleman, you might ask me to sit down, I think.
Opening	LIZA: Don't I tell you I'm bring you business?
Challenging/Opening	HIGGINS: Pickering: shall we ask this baggage to sit down, or shall we throw her out of the window?
Challenging	LIZA: Ah-ah-oh-ow-ow-ow-oo! I won't be called a baggage when I've offered to pay like any lady.

Obviously, there are complications as a result of the three-party conversation. Exchange-structure analysis is more suited to simple two-party conversation.

10. What about another go at *Romeo & Juliet*? What significance is it that there are supporting or challenging moves? Here is the encounter between Juliet and Paris in Friar Lawrence's cell (Act 4, scene 1).

Enter JULIET.
Par. Happily met, my lady and my wife!
Jul. That may be, sir, when I may be a wife.
Par. That 'may be' must be, love, on Thursday next.
Jul. What must be shall be.
Fri. L. That's a certain text. ²²
Par. Come you to make confession to this father?
Jul. To answer that, I should confess to you.
Par. Do not deny to him that you love me.
Jul. I will confess to you that I love him.
Par. So will ye, I am sure, that you love me.
<i>Jul</i> . If I do so, it will be of more price, ²³
Being spoke behind your back, than to your face.
Par. Poor soul, thy face is much abus'd with tears.
Jul. The tears have got small victory by that;
For it was bad enough before their spite. ²⁴
Par. Thou wrong'st it, more than tears, with that report.
Jul. That is no slander, sir, which is a truth;
And what I spake, I spake it to my face.
Par. Thy face is mine, and thou hast slander'd it.
Jul. It may be so, for it is not mine own.
Are you at leisure, holy father, now;
Or shall I come to you at evening mass?
<i>Fri. L.</i> My leisure serves me, pensive ²⁵ daughter, now:
My lord, we must entreat the time alone.
Par. God shield, ²⁶ I should disturb devotion!
Juliet, on Thursday early will I rouse you:
Till then, adieu; and keep this holy kiss. [<i>Exit</i> .
Jul. O! shut the door! and when thou hast done so,
Come weep with me; past hope, past cure, past help!

We can also apply the framework to *Equus*, from Scene 19.

Alan rises and enters the square. He is subdued.
DYSART (1) Good afternoon
ALAN (2) Afternoon
DYSART (3) I'm sorry about our row yesterday.
ALAN (4) It was stupid.
DYSART (5) It was.
ALAN (6) What I said, I mean.

²² *a certain text*: 'a true saying'

²⁶ *God shield*: 'God forbid'

²³ price: 'value'

²⁴ 'my face had so little beauty before their injury (*spite*) that the tears have gained only a small victory by destroying it' ²⁵ *pensive*: 'sorrowful'

DYSART (7) How are you sleeping? Alan shrugs. You're not feeling well, are you? ALAN (8) All right. DYSART (9) Would you like to play a game? It could make you feel better. ALAN (10) What kind? DYSART (11) It's colled <i>Blink</i> . You have to fix your over on comething; say, that little stail	
You're not feeling well, are you? ALAN (8) All right. DYSART (9) Would you like to play a game? It could make you feel better. ALAN (10) What kind?	
ALAN (8) All right. DYSART (9) Would you like to play a game? It could make you feel better. ALAN (10) What kind?	
DYSART (9) Would you like to play a game? It could make you feel better. ALAN (10) What kind?	
ALAN (10) What kind?	
DYSART (11) It's called Blink You have to fix your avec on compathing any that little statistics	
DYSART (11) It's called <i>Blink</i> . You have to fix your eyes on something: say, that little stain	n
over there on the wall – and I tap this pen on the desk. The first time I tap it, you	
close your eyes. The next time you open them. And so on. Close, open, close, open,	
till I say Stop.	
ALAN (12) How can that make you feel better?	
DYSART (13) It relaxes you. You'll feel as though you're talking to me in your sleep.	
ALAN (14) It's stupid.	
DYSART (15) You don't have to do it, if you don't want to.	
ALAN (16) I didn't say I didn't want to.	
DYSART (17) Well?	
ALAN (18) I don't mind.	
DYSART (19) Good. Sit down and start watching that stain. Put your hands by your side	s.
and open the fingers wide.	- 7
He opens the left bench and Alan sits on the end of it.	
The thing is to feel comfortable, and relax absolutely Are you looking at the stain?	
ALAN (20) Yes.	
DYSART (21) Right. Now try and keep your mind as blank as possible.	
ALAN (22) That's not difficult	
DYSART (23) Ssh. Stop talking On the first tap, close. On the second, open. Are you	
ready?	
(24) Can you hear me?	
ALAN (25) Mmm.	
DYSART (26) You can speak normally. Say Yes, if you can.	
ALAN (27) Yes.	
DYSART (28) Good boy. Now raise your head, and open your eyes.	
He does so.	
Now, Alan, you're going to answer questions I'm going to ask you. Do you understand?	
ALAN (29) Yes. DYSART (30) And when you wake up, you are going to remember everything you tell m	~
DYSART (30) And when you wake up, you are going to remember everything you tell me	ೆ.
All right? ALAN (31) Yes.	
DYSART (32) Good. Now I want you to think back in time. You are on that beach you	
told me about. The tide has gone out, and you're making sandcastles. Above you,	
staring down at you, is that great horse's head, and the cream dropping from it. Can	
you see that?	
ALAN (33) Yes.	
DYSART (34) You ask him a question. 'Does the chain hurt?'	
ALAN (35) Yes.	
DYSART (36) Do you ask him aloud?	
ALAN (37) No.	
DYSART (38) And what does the horse say back?	
ALAN (39) 'Yes.'	
DYSART (40) Then what do you say?	
ALAN (41) 'I'll take it out for you.'	

II. Joanna Gavins's Text World Theory

From Joanna Gavins's website:

Text World Theory is a cognitive-linguistic model of human discourse processing.

Its theoretical origins can be traced to a number of diverse academic disciplines, including cognitive psychology, possible worlds theory, cognitive linguistics and literary theory.

The basic premise of Text World Theory is that human beings process and understand all discourse by constructing mental representations of it in their minds. Text World Theory aims to provide the methodological tools necessary for the systematic examination and discussion of these mental representations, or text-worlds.

Text World Theory was originally developed by Professor Paul Werth at the University of Amsterdam during the 1980s and 1990s. Werth provided a detailed account of the fundamental workings of the text-world framework in his monograph *Text Worlds: Representing Conceptual Space in Discourse*, which was published posthumously in 1999.

Werth claimed to have devised a methodological framework capable of accounting for the cognitive processes behind the production and interpretation of all forms of human communication; from telephone conversations to dramatic performance, from church sermons to newspaper reports. These ambitious objectives, coupled with Werth's infectious enthusiasm and inspiring prose, have continued to generate great interest in Text World Theory in the years since their author's death.

Text World Theory in the 21st Century is one of the most dynamic and influential areas of current cognitive study.

There are three interconnecting levels:

- **discourse world**: 'governed by certain tacit discourse principles, according to which the participants both expect and agree to perform coherent and co-operative communication'
- **text world**: mental representations constructed by each participant, made up of *world-building* elements and *function-advancing propositions* and dictated by
 - linguistic indicators
 - o inferences drawn from the participants' background knowledge and experience
- **new worlds** (Werth: **sub-worlds**), created by discourse participants (*participant-accessible world*) or characters (*character-accessible world*), including
 - world switches (eg new place, flashback)
 - o modal worlds (worlds that don't exist, but may, can, should, must, etc. exist)

Text world theory (Werth 1999; Gavins 2007) is a dynamic model of discourse processing that explains how writers and readers build rich mental configurations of fictional and non-fictional content. In text world theory terms, a writer and reader share a discourse world, which consists of their physical surroundings, their individual and culturally dependent ideologies, memories and desires, and any shared and personal knowledge they hold. They use these contextual factors in conjunction with textual elements to construct rich mental representations called text worlds that have both *world-building elements* (aspects of time, place and characters) and *function-advancing propositions* (processes and events that drive the narrative and modify the contents of the original world).

For example, when in the discourse world a reader encounters the words 'I stepped off the pavement', she will construct a text world that is located in the past (the use of the past tense sets up the world's temporal parameters), contains a character in the form of the narrating voice with whom the reader is asked to identify through the use of the first person pronoun 'I', and has some sense of place ('pavement' would in the vast majority of cases lead to readers imagining that this was taking place in a built-up area). In this last example, 'pavement' acts as a cue for activating various degrees of background *encyclopaedic knowledge* that a reader would draw on to 'flesh out' this mental representation. Clearly, since experience varies from reader to reader, one individual's text world might differ from another's. However, as experiences are culturally-bound, we can expect conceptualisations to be reasonably similar, for example, for readers in the UK. Importantly, only background knowledge relating to pavements and roads are likely to be activated. Together, these provide a way of explaining how broadly similar yet subtly idiosyncratic conceptualisations and interpretations of the same line of text are possible.

Text world theory has been largely used as an analytical tool within the field of cognitive poetics (see Giovanelli 2013, for an overview of work), and to a lesser extent within educational contexts (de Obregon et al. 2009; Giovanelli 2010). In what follows, we aim to show how it can also provide a beneficial tool for the teacher to think and plan with.

Marcello Giovanelli and Jessica Mason (2015), '"Well I don't feel that": schemas, worlds, and authentic reading in the classroom', *English in Education* 49(1): 49.





To discuss:

- how would the Text World Theory be potentially useful for plays like Equus and The Importance of Being Earnest?
- are we always able to identify the triggers for the text worlds the world building elements?
- are the disjunctions between the worlds creative?

Cecily. Are you called Algernon?

Algernon. I cannot deny it.

Cecily. Oh!

Gwendolen. Is your name really John?

Jack. [Standing rather proudly.] I could deny it if I liked. I could deny anything if I liked. But my name certainly is John. It has been John for years.

Cecily. [To Gwendolen.] A gross deception has been practised on both of us.

Gwendolen. My poor wounded Cecily!

Cecily. My sweet wronged Gwendolen!

Gwendolen. [Slowly and seriously.] You will call me sister, will you not? [They embrace. Jack and Algernon groan and walk up and down.]

Cecily. [Rather brightly.] There is just one question I would like to be allowed to ask my guardian.

Gwendolen. An admirable idea! Mr Worthing, there is just one question I would like to be permitted to put to you. Where is your brother Ernest? We are both engaged to be married to your brother Ernest, so it is a matter of some importance to us to know where your brother Ernest is at present.

Jack. [Slowly and hesitatingly.] Gwendolen—Cecily—it is very painful for me to be forced to speak the truth. It is the first time in my life that I have ever been reduced to such a painful position, and I am really quite inexperienced in doing anything of the kind. However, I will tell you quite frankly that I have no brother Ernest. I have no brother at all. I never had a brother in my life, and I certainly have not the smallest intention of ever having one in the future.

Cecily. [Surprised.] No brother at all?

Jack. [Cheerily.] None!

Gwendolen. [Severely.] Had you never a brother of any kind?

Jack. [Pleasantly.] Never. Not even of an kind.

Gwendolen. I am afraid it is quite clear, Cecily, that neither of us is engaged to be married to any one.

Cecily. It is not a very pleasant position for a young girl suddenly to find herself in. Is it?

Gwendolen. Let us go into the house. They will hardly venture to come after us there.

Cecily. No, men are so cowardly, aren't they?

[They retire into the house with scornful looks.]

Act 2, Part 2